

課程名稱：**批判實在論與社會研究**（6456）

開課系所：10502 社會系碩、博班

授課教師：許甘霖（kanlin@thu.edu.tw 分機：36320）

上課地點與時間：SS312-2，9:10~12:00（二）

辦公室時間：請預約

● 課程簡介

本課程旨在介紹批判實在論取徑（critical realism, CR），特別聚焦於批判實在論的**實際應用**。課程分為 6 個循序漸進的單元：（1）預備：透過相關中文文獻，建立對 CR 的初步理解；（2）基礎：透過 CR 初期奠墊基者 Andrew Sayer 的《社會科學的研究方法：批判實在論取徑》（2016/2010），定位 CR 的方法學特質；（3）發展：透過 CR 新生代 Dave Elder-Vass 的 *The Reality of Social Construction*（2013）聚焦於語言、文化與知識之因果作用的檢視，回應實在論與社會建構論爭論。（4）實例：透過實例，學習 CR 的運用；（5）研究方法與概念化：CR 與既有研究方法的接合，以及如何將經驗研究結果概念化；（6）批判的評價：對 CR 的反思與批判。

● 課程目標：

透過這六個課程單元，預期修課同學可以透過循序漸進的步驟和階段，將 CR 落實到具體研究之中。

● 課程要求及評分：

1. 每週 2-3 篇期刊論文或專書章節，修課者須輪流導讀，並於上課時將 memo 印出發給參與修課者。（60%）
2. 期末報告（40%，5,000-8,000 字）：修課者試擬「CR 取徑的方法學章節」，包括「I：與自己研究有關的 CR 概念」及「II：CR 啟發的分析架構或研究設計」。

● 修課建議：

1. 同時修習或已修過「質性研究方法」課程且已有具體研究方向，正準備提研

究計畫書者。

2. 已通過論文計畫書，論文撰寫處於資料分析及組織論證者。

● **使用書目**：(專書部分，文章部分見各週)

Sayer, Andrew, (2016/2010)《社會科學的研究方法：批判實在論取徑》(*Method in Social Science: Revised 2nd Edition*)。台北：巨流。

Dave Elder-Vass, 2013. *The Reality of Social Construction*. Cambridge University Press.

Andrew Brown, Steve Fleetwood and John Michael Roberts (eds), 2007/2001. 《批判實在論與馬克思主義》(*Critical Realism and Marxism*)，廣西師範大學出版社。

Ackroyd, S. and Fleetwood, S., eds. (2004) *Realist Applications in Organisation and Management Studies*. Routledge.

Bob Carter and Caroline New, 2004. *Making Realism Work: Realist Social Theory and Empirical Research*. Routledge.

● **進階閱讀** (摘自 Sayer, *Method in Social Science* 第二版修訂版序言)

Method in Social Science: A Realist Approach 第二版 (1992) 之後，已有很多關於實在論與社會科學方法的著作出版。有些處理像是後結構主義、後現代主義及論述的轉向等相競取向，爭論這些取向在什麼限度內與實在論可以相容 (如 Lopez and Potter 2001; Pearce and Fauley 2008; Joseph and Roberts 2003)。我的《實在論與社會科學》(*Realism and Social Science*, 2000) 處理的是比本書更寬廣的議題，包括對後現代主義的回應、空間的討論、敘事與社會理論、社會科學裡的價值，以及批判的社會科學。結構與施為間關係的理論受到廣泛爭論，主要著作有/xii/Margaret Archer (1995, 2000, 2003)、Rob Stones (1996) 和 Dave Elder-Vass (2005, 2008)。

還有很多專書或論文討論特定社會科學和研究領域如何「運用」實在論。除了 Danermark 等人論「解說」(explanation) 的《解說社會》(*Explaining Society: Critical Realism in the Social Sciences*, 1997) 外，還有涵蓋幾個學門的論文集 (Cruickshank 2003; Carter and New 2004)，以及探討實在論與人類學 (Davies 2008)、論述分析 (Fairclough et al. 2003)、經濟學 (Lawson 1997; Fleetwood 1998)、女性主義 (New 1998, 2003, 2005)、國際關係 (Patomaki

2001)、法律 (Norrie 2009)、組織研究 (Fleetwood and Ackroyd 2004)、政治經濟學 (Jessop 2005)、心理學 (Parker 1999)、社會學 (New 1995) 等之關係的作品。也有作品處理實在論與更特定理論和主題的關係，例如馬克思主義 (Brown et al. 2001)、自然的概念 (Benton 1993)、文化領導權的政治理論 (Joseph 2002)、「種族」(Carter 2000)、量化方法 (Morgan and Olsen 2005) 和健康研究 (Clark et al. 2007)。以上只是快速增長文獻中的小部分。無論讀者身處於社會科學的哪個領域，應該都能找到實在論與其興趣議題相關的討論。

在更哲學的層次上，批判實在論之基本論證的討論仍持續著，像是客觀性與價值 (Collier 1994, 2003)、因果關係 (Groff 2008)，而新的主題像是倫理學 (Collier 1999; Norrie 2009)，以及批判實在論主要創建者 Roy Bhaskar 的近期作品。國際批判實在論學會 (The International Association for Critical Realism) 及其官方刊物《批判實在論學刊》(*Journal of Critical Realism*) 則為更多這類辯論提供論壇 (亦見 Archer et al. 1998)。

- 進階書目：

Andrew Collier, 1994, *Critical Realism: An Introduction to Roy Bhaskar's Philosophy*. Verso.

Mervyn Hartwig (ed), 2007. *Dictionary of Critical Realism*. Routledge.

Ray Pawson, 2008. *Evidence-Based Policy: A Realist Perspective*. SAGE.

Andrew Sayer, 2004, *Realism and Social Science*. SAGE.

Cruickshank, J. (ed). (2003) *Critical Realism: The Difference it Makes*, London: Routledge.

Fairclough N., Jessop B. and Sayer, A. (2003) 'Critical realism and semiosis' in J. Joseph and J.R. Roberts (eds) *Realism, Discourse and Deconstruction*, London: Routledge, pp. 23–42.

Fleetwood, S. (ed.) (1998) *Critical Realism in Economics: Development and Debate*, London: Routledge.

Stones, R. (1996) *Sociological Reasoning: Towards a Post-Modern Sociology*, Macmillan.

Lawson, T. (1997) *Economics and Reality*, London: Routledge.

Patomaki, H. (2001) *After International Relations: Critical Realism and the (Re)Construction of World Politics*, London: Routledge.

Norrie, A. (2009) *Dialectic and Difference: Dialectical Critical Realism and*

the Grounds of Justice, London: Routledge.

Joseph, J. (2002) *Hegemony: A Realist Analysis*, London: Routledge.

Joseph, J. and Roberts, J.R. (eds.) (2003) *Realism, Discourse and Deconstruction*, London: Routledge.

Lawson, T. (2014/1997) 《經濟學與實在》 (*Economics and Reality*)，高等教育出版社。

Maxwell, J. A. (2012). *A realist approach for qualitative research*. Sage.

Berth Danermark, Mats Ekstrom, Liselotte Jakobsen and Janch Karlsson (2001) *Explaining Society: An Introduction to Critical Realism in the Social Sciences*. Routledge.

Roy Bhaskar, Margaret Archer, Andrew Collier, Tony Lawson and Alan Norrie, eds. (1998) *Critical Realism: Essential Readings*. Routledge

Andrew Brown, Steve Fleetwood and John Michael Roberts (eds), 2007/2001. 《批判實在論與馬克思主義》 (*Critical Realism and Marxism*)，廣西師範大學出版社。

Jessop, B. (2005) 'Critical realism and the strategic relational approach', *New Formations*, 56, 40–53.

Elder-Vass, D. (2008) 'Searching for realism, structure and agency in actor network theory'. *British Journal of Sociology*, 59:3, 455–73.

Andrew Sayer, 2012, 'Power, causality and normativity: a critical realist critique of Foucault.' *Journal of Political Power*. 5, 2, 179-194.

New, C. (2005) 'Sex and gender: a critical realist approach', *New Formations*, 56, 54–70.

- 網路資源

Journal of Critical Realism <http://www.maneyonline.com/loi/rea>

Selected articles from *Understanding Society: Innovative thinking about social agency and structure in a global world* (Daniel Little's blog) <http://understandingsociety.blogspot.tw/>

課程進度

- **Week 01 (0214)：課程導論**

- **Week 02、04 (0221、0307)：預備**

單元主旨：透過中文著作，初步熟悉 CR 的基本概念及運用

許甘霖，2000，〈放任與壓制之外：政治化薪資形構初探〉，《台灣社會研究》，第 38 期，頁 1-58。

許甘霖，2002，〈民粹金權主義？黨資本，股市投機與政治動員〉，收於瞿海源、蕭代基、楊國樞主編，《台灣社會問題研究》，台北：巨流，頁 1-74。

郭秋永，2003，〈科學哲學中的兩種因果解析〉，《政治與社會哲學評論》，第 4 輯，頁 121-177。

郭秋永，2005，〈批判實存主義與價值中立原則〉，《人文及社會科學集刊》，17，3，565-614。

萬毓澤，2005，〈重建馬克思（主義）：批判實在論的觀點〉，《政治科學季評》，5 期，頁 8-14。

萬毓澤，2006，〈馬克思論「利潤率趨向下降的規律」：批判實在論的解讀〉，未發表手稿。

- **Week 03 (0228)：和平紀念日放假**

- **Week 05~07 (0314, 0321, 0328)：基礎**

單元主旨：透過 Andrew Sayer 的導論，理解 CR 在社會科學哲學與研究方法關係中的定位。

Andrew Sayer (2016/2010) 《社會科學的研究方法：批判實在論取徑》(*Method in Social Science: Revised 2nd Edition*)。台北：巨流。

- **Week 08 (0404)：休假**

- **Week 09~12 (0411, 0418, 0425, 0502)：發展**

單元主旨：透過 CR 新世代 Dave Elder-Vass 的著作，瞭解 CR 的新近發展。

Dave Elder-Vass, 2013. *The Reality of Social Construction*. Cambridge University Press.

- **Week 13~14 (0509, 0516)：應用實例**

單元主旨：透過研究實例，學習如何在研究中運用 CR 取徑。

Clark, M., MacIntyre, P.D. and Cruickshank, J. (2007) 'A critical realist approach to understanding and evaluating heart health programmes.' *Health*, 11:4, 513–39.

Henry Wai-chung Yeung, 1997, 'Critical realism and realist research in human geography: a method or a philosophy in search of a method?' *Progress in Human Geography* 21, 1, 51-74.

David Pilgrim, 2013, 'The Failure of Diagnostic Psychiatry and some prospects of Scientific Progress Offered by Critical Realism.' *Journal of Critical Realism*, 12, 3, 336-358.

Bernard Leca and Philippe Naccache, 2006, 'A Critical Realist Approach To Institutional Entrepreneurship.' *Organization*, 13(5): 627–651.

Sam Porter, 1993, 'Critical Realist Ethnography: The Case of Racism and Professionalism in a Medical Setting.' *Sociology*, 27: 591-609.

Simon J. Williams, 1999, 'Is anybody there? Critical realism, chronic illness and the disability debate.' *Sociology of Health & Illness* 21(6): 797–819.

Selected chapters from *Critical Realist Applications in Organisation and Management Studies*.

Ch11: "Working in teams: ethnographic evidence from two 'high performance' workplace." (Rick. Delbridge)

Ch13: "Tracing the effects of a hospital merger." (Ruth Kowalczyk)

Ch14: "The moral management of nursing labour power: Conceptualizing control and resistance." (Carole and Peter Kennedy)

Selected chapters from *Making Realism Work*:

Ch4: Class as Variable, Class as Generative Mechanism: The importance of critical realism for the sociology of health inequalities (Higgs, P; Jones, I; Scambler, G)

Ch6: Methodological triangulation and realist research. An Indian exemplar. (Wendy Olsen)

Ch7: Health visitors and "disadvantaged" parent-clients: designing realist research (Angie Hart)

● **Week 15 (0523) : 質性方法與概念化**

單元主旨：聚焦於 CR 的方法學的意涵，特別是如何落實到研究方法和論證。

- Meyer, S. B., & Lunney, B. (2013). The application of abductive and retroductive inference for the design and analysis of theory-driven sociological research. *Sociological Research Online*, 18(1), 12.
- Eastwood, J. G., Jalaludin, B. B., & Kemp, L. A. (2014). Realist explanatory theory building method for social epidemiology: a protocol for a mixed method multilevel study of neighbourhood context and postnatal depression. *SpringerPlus*, 3(1), 1.
- Downward, P., & Mearman, A. (2007). Retroduction as mixed-methods triangulation in economic research: reorienting economics into social science. *Cambridge Journal of Economics*, 31(1), 77-99.
- Andrew Sayer, 2000, 'System, Lifeworld and Gender: Associational Versus Counterfactual Thinking.' *Sociology* 34, 4, 707-725.
- Sue Llewellyn, 2007, "Case studies and differentiated realities." *Qualitative Research in Accounting & Management*, 4, 1, 53-68. Together with A. Sayer, 2008, 'Case studies and a single, differentiated reality: a reply to Sue Llewellyn.' *Qualitative Research in Accounting and Management*, 5, 1, 11-14.
- Markos Zachariadis, Susan V. Scott, Michael Barrett, 2013, 'Methodological Implications of Critical Realism for Mixed-Methods Research.' *MIS Quarterly* 37, 3, 855-879.
- Morgan, J. and Olsen, W. (2005) 'Towards a critical epistemology of analytical statistics: realism in mathematical method', *Journal for the Theory of Social Behaviour*, 35:3, 255-84.
- Geoff Easton, 2010, Critical realism in case study research. *Industrial Marketing Management*, 39, 118-128.
- Søren Jeppesen (2005) Critical Realism as an Approach to Unfolding Empirical Findings: Thoughts on Fieldwork in South Africa on SMEs and Environment. *The Journal of Transdisciplinary Environmental Studies*, 4, 1, 1-9.
- Phil McEvoy and David Richards (2003) Critical realism: a way forward for evaluation research in nursing? *Journal of Advanced Nursing* 43, 4,

411–420.

John Michael Roberts (2014) Critical Realism, Dialectics, and Qualitative Research Methods. *Journal for the Theory of Social Behaviour*, 44:1, 1-23.

Roy, M. J., Baker, R., & Kerr, S. (2016). Conceptualising the public health role of actors operating outside of formal health systems: The case of social enterprise. *Social Science & Medicine*.

Steve Fleetwood, 2014, “Conceptualizing Future Labour Markets.” *Journal of Critical Realism*, 13, 3, 233-260.

● **Week 16 (0530) : 端午節休假**

● **Week 17 (0607) : 批判的評價**

單元主旨：對 CR 的批判與反思

Martyn Hammersley, 2009, “Why Critical Realism Fails to Justify Critical Social Research.” *Methodological Innovations Online*, 4(2) 1-11.

Phil Gorski, 2013, “What is Critical Realism? And Why Should You Care?” *Contemporary Sociology*, 42: 658-70.

Richard Gunn, 1989, “Marxism and philosophy: a critique of critical realism.” *Capital and Class*, 37, 1-30.

Kevin Magill, 1994. “Against Critical Realism.” *Capital & Class*, 18, 3, 113-136.

Justin Cruickshank, 2004, ‘A tale of two ontologies: an immanent critique of critical realism.’ *The Sociological Review*, 52, 4, 567–585.

Frank Kalter and Clemens Kroneberg, 2014, ‘Between Mechanism Talk and Mechanism Cult: New Emphases in Explanatory Sociology and Empirical Research.’ *Kölner Zeitschrift für Soziologie und Sozialpsychologie*, 66, 1, 91-115.

John Holmwood, 2001. ‘Gender and Critical Realism: A Critique of Sayer.’ *Sociology*, 35(4): 947-965.

● **Week 18 (0614) : final exam**

繳交期末報告